

# COVID-19 CADTH REFERENCE LIST

# Prone Positioning for the Management of COVID-19: Clinical Effectiveness and Guidelines

# This report was published on May 19, 2020

To produce this report, CADTH used a modified approach to the selection, appraisal, and synthesis of the evidence to meet decision-making needs during the COVID-19 pandemic. Care has been taken to ensure the information is accurate and complete, but it should be noted that international scientific evidence about COVID-19 is changing and growing rapidly.

Version: 1.0

Publication Date: May 2020 Report Length: 8 Pages



Authors: Diksha Kumar, Carolyn Spry

Cite As: Prone Positioning for the Management of COVID-19: Clinical Effectiveness and Guidelines. Ottawa: CADTH; 2020 May. (CADTH Reference List).

**Disclaimer:** The information in this document is intended to help Canadian health care decision-makers, health care professionals, health systems leaders, and policy-makers make well-informed decisions and thereby improve the quality of health care services. While patients and others may access this document, the document is made available for informational purposes only and no representations or warranties are made with respect to its fitness for any particular purpose. The information in this document should not be used as a substitute for professional medical advice or as a substitute for the application of clinical judgment in respect of the care of a particular patient or other professional judgment in any decision-making process. The Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health (CADTH) does not endorse any information, drugs, therapies, treatments, products, processes, or services.

While care has been taken to ensure that the information prepared by CADTH in this document is accurate, complete, and up-to-date as at the applicable date the material was first published by CADTH, CADTH does not make any guarantees to that effect. CADTH does not guarantee and is not responsible for the quality, currency, propriety, accuracy, or reasonableness of any statements, information, or conclusions contained in any third-party materials used in preparing this document. The views and opinions of third parties published in this document do not necessarily state or reflect those of CADTH.

CADTH is not responsible for any errors, omissions, injury, loss, or damage arising from or relating to the use (or misuse) of any information, statements, or conclusions contained in or implied by the contents of this document or any of the source materials.

This document may contain links to third-party websites. CADTH does not have control over the content of such sites. Use of third-party sites is governed by the third-party website owners' own terms and conditions set out for such sites. CADTH does not make any guarantee with respect to any information contained on such third-party sites and CADTH is not responsible for any injury, loss, or damage suffered as a result of using such third-party sites. CADTH has no responsibility for the collection, use, and disclosure of personal information by third-party sites.

Subject to the aforementioned limitations, the views expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the views of Health Canada, Canada's provincial or territorial governments, other CADTH funders, or any third-party supplier of information.

This document is prepared and intended for use in the context of the Canadian health care system. The use of this document outside of Canada is done so at the user's own risk.

This disclaimer and any questions or matters of any nature arising from or relating to the content or use (or misuse) of this document will be governed by and interpreted in accordance with the laws of the Province of Ontario and the laws of Canada applicable therein, and all proceedings shall be subject to the exclusive jurisdiction of the courts of the Province of Ontario, Canada.

The copyright and other intellectual property rights in this document are owned by CADTH and its licensors. These rights are protected by the Canadian *Copyright Act* and other national and international laws and agreements. Users are permitted to make copies of this document for non-commercial purposes only, provided it is not modified when reproduced and appropriate credit is given to CADTH and its licensors.

**About CADTH:** CADTH is an independent, not-for-profit organization responsible for providing Canada's health care decision-makers with objective evidence to help make informed decisions about the optimal use of drugs, medical devices, diagnostics, and procedures in our health care system.

Funding: CADTH receives funding from Canada's federal, provincial, and territorial governments, with the exception of Quebec.

Questions or requests for information about this report can be directed to requests@cadth.ca



### **Research Questions**

- 1. What is the clinical effectiveness of prone positioning in the management of coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in adults?
- 2. What are the evidence-based guidelines regarding hospital bed positioning for the management of coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in adults?

### **Key Findings**

One evidence-based guideline was identified regarding hospital bed positioning for the management of coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in adults. No literature was identified regarding the clinical effectiveness of prone positioning for the management of coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in adults.

### **Methods**

A limited literature search was conducted by an information specialist on key resources including PubMed, the Cochrane Library, the websites of Canadian and major international health technology agencies, as well as a focused internet search. The search strategy was comprised of both controlled vocabulary, such as the National Library of Medicine's MeSH (Medical Subject Headings), and keywords. The main search concepts were COVID-19 and patient positioning. No search filters were applied to limit retrieval by publication type. Where possible, retrieval was limited to the human population. The search was also limited to English-language documents published between January 1, 2018 and May 1, 2020. Internet links were provided, where available.

### **Selection Criteria**

One reviewer screened citations and selected studies based on the inclusion criteria presented in Table 1.

**Table 1: Selection Criteria** 

Population	Adults with coronavirus disease (COVID-19) requiring respiratory support
Intervention	Q1: Prone positioning (i.e., lying on the stomach, bed flat); prone Trendelenburg position (i.e., lying on stomach, head lower than heart) Q2: Patient positioning in hospital beds (e.g., prone, supine)
Comparator	Q1: Prone positioning (i.e., lying on the stomach, bed flat); Trendelenburg position (i.e., lying on back, head lower than heart); reverse Trendelenburg (i.e., lying on back, head higher than heart); elevated seated positions Q2: Not applicable
Outcomes	Q1: Clinical effectiveness (e.g., oxygenation, hemodynamic status, airway management, mortality) and safety (e.g., aspiration) Q2: Recommendations regarding patient positioning
Study Designs	Health technology assessments, systematic reviews, randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies, and evidence-based guidelines



### Results

One evidence-based guideline<sup>1</sup> was identified regarding hospital bed positioning for the management of coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in adults. No relevant health technology assessments, systematic reviews, randomized controlled trials, or non-randomized studies were identified.

References of potential interest that did not meet the inclusion criteria are provided in the appendix.

### **Overall Summary of Findings**

One evidence-based guideline<sup>1</sup> was identified regarding hospital bed positioning for the management of COVID-19 in adults. The European Society of Intensive Care Medicine and the Society of Critical Care Medicine suggest 12 to 16 hours of prone ventilation for mechanically ventilated patients with COVID-19 and moderate to severe acute respiratory distress syndrome.<sup>1</sup>

No relevant literature was found regarding the clinical effectiveness of prone positioning for the management of COVID-19 in adults; therefore, no summary can be provided.

### **References Summarized**

Health Technology Assessments

No literature identified.

Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses

No literature identified.

Randomized Controlled Trials

No literature identified.

Non-Randomized Studies

No literature identified.

### **Guidelines and Recommendations**

 Alhazzani W, Moller MH, Arabi YM, et al. Surviving Sepsis Campaign: guidelines on the management of critically ill adults with coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19). Crit Care Med. 2020 Mar 27. Available from

https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC7101866/pdf/134\_2020\_Article\_6022.pdf. Accessed 2020 May 15

PubMed: PM32224769



## Appendix — Further Information

### Non-Randomized Studies

### Pre-Post Intervention Studies

- Caputo ND, Strayer RJ, Levitan R. Early Self-proning in awake, non-intubated patients in the emergency department: a single ED's experience during the COVID-19 pandemic. Acad Emerg Med. 2020 Apr 22. [Epub ahead of print] <u>PubMed: PM32320506</u>
- Scaravilli V, Grasselli G, Castagna L, et al. Prone positioning improves oxygenation in spontaneously breathing nonintubated patients with hypoxemic acute respiratory failure: a retrospective study. *J Crit Care*. 2015 Dec;30(6):1390-1394.
   PubMed: PM26271685

### No Comparator

 Ding L, Wang L, Ma W, He H. Efficacy and safety of early prone positioning combined with HFNC or NIV in moderate to severe ARDS: a multi-center prospective cohort study. Crit Care. 2020 Jan 30;24(1):28.
 PubMed: PM32000806

### **Preliminary Reports**

 Ziehr DR, Alladina J, Petri CR, et al. Respiratory pathophysiology of mechanically ventilated patients with COVID-19: a cohort study. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2020 Apr 29. [Epub ahead of print] PubMed: PM32348678

### Clinical Practice Guidelines

- Provincial guidance: prone positioning for adult COVID-19 patients. Edmonton (AB): Critical Care Strategic Clinical Network, Alberta Health Services; 2020 Mar: <a href="https://site.cmg.io/scnresearch/Prone">https://site.cmg.io/scnresearch/Prone</a> Positioning for COVID patients- V5.0.pdf. Accessed 2020 May 14
- SARS CoV-2. Guidance document. Irving (TX): American Association for Respiratory Care; 2020 Mar 27: <a href="https://www.aarc.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/guidance-document-SARS-COVID19.pdf">https://www.aarc.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/guidance-document-SARS-COVID19.pdf</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
   See: Recommendations from the SCCM task force, page 6
- Wilson KC, Chotirmall SH, Bai C, Rello J. COVID-19: Interim guidance on management pending empirical evidence. New York (NY): American Thoracic Society; 2020 Apr 3. Available from: <a href="https://www.thoracic.org/covid/covid-19-guidance.pdf">https://www.thoracic.org/covid/covid-19-guidance.pdf</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14 See: Suggestion #5, page 6
- COVID-19 Guidelines. Camberwell (AU): The Australian and New Zealand Intensive Care Society (ANZICS); 2020 Mar 16. Available from: <a href="https://www.anzics.com.au/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/ANZICS-COVID-19-Guidelines-Version-1.pdf">https://www.anzics.com.au/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/ANZICS-COVID-19-Guidelines-Version-1.pdf</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14

See: Routine management of COVID-19 associated respiratory failure, 5. Prone positioning, page 29



- Bamford P, Bentley A, Dean J, Whitmore D, Wilson-Baig N. ICS guidance for prone positioning of the conscious COVID patient. London (UK): Intensive Care Society; 2020. Available from: <a href="https://emcrit.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/2020-04-12-Guidance-for-conscious-proning.pdf">https://emcrit.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/04/2020-04-12-Guidance-for-conscious-proning.pdf</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
- Jin YH, Cai L, Cheng ZS, et al. A rapid advice guideline for the diagnosis and treatment of 2019 novel coronavirus (2019-nCoV) infected pneumonia (standard version). Mil Med Res. 2020 Feb 6;7(1):4. Available from:
   <a href="https://mmrjournal.biomedcentral.com/track/pdf/10.1186/s40779-020-0233-6">https://mmrjournal.biomedcentral.com/track/pdf/10.1186/s40779-020-0233-6</a>.
   Accessed 2020 May 14
   See: 6.5.1 Hypoxemic respiratory failure and ARDS treatments, (4) Invasive mechanical ventilation, page 17
   <a href="https://pubmed.pm.nih.gov/">Pubmed: PM32029004</a>
- Kluge S, Janssens U, Welte T, Weber-Carstens S, Marx G, Karagiannidis C. German recommendations for critically ill patients with COVID-19. *Med Klin Intensivmed Notfmed*. 2020 Apr 14. [Epub ahead of print] <u>PubMed: PM32291505</u>
- Massachusetts General Hospital: treatment guidance for critically ill patients with COVID-19. Boston(MA): General Hospital Corp; 2020 Apr 5: Available from: <a href="https://www.massgeneral.org/assets/MGH/pdf/news/coronavirus/treatment-guidance-for-critically-ill-patients-with-COVID-19.pdf">https://www.massgeneral.org/assets/MGH/pdf/news/coronavirus/treatment-guidance-for-critically-ill-patients-with-COVID-19.pdf</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
   See: Management of Respiratory Failure, Prone Ventilation, page 7
- COVID19 proning protocol "PRONOCOL." Omaha (NE): Nebraska Medicine; 2020: Available from: <a href="https://www.nebraskamed.com/sites/default/files/documents/covid-19/proning-protocol.pdf">https://www.nebraskamed.com/sites/default/files/documents/covid-19/proning-protocol.pdf</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
- Care of critically ill patients with COVID-19. NIH COVID-19 treatment guidelines.
   Bethesda (MD): National Institutes of Health; 2020: Available from: <a href="https://www.covid19treatmentguidelines.nih.gov/critical-care/">https://www.covid19treatmentguidelines.nih.gov/critical-care/</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14 See: Ventilatory Support, Recommendation #5
- 16. COVID-19: Proning considerations for patients on HFNC or BIPAP. Rapid guidance summary. Philadelphia (PA). Penn Medicine Center for Evidence-based Practice; 2020 Apr 8. Available from: <a href="http://www.uphs.upenn.edu/cep/COVID/Proning%20for%20HFNC%20or%20BIPAP%20final%20(2).pdf">http://www.uphs.upenn.edu/cep/COVID/Proning%20for%20HFNC%20or%20BIPAP%20final%20(2).pdf</a> Accessed 2020 May 14
- 17. Clinical management of patients with moderate to severe COVID-19 interim guidance. Ottawa (ON): Health Canada; 2020 Apr 2. Available from: <a href="https://www.canada.ca/en/public-health/services/diseases/2019-novel-coronavirus-infection/clinical-management-covid-19.html">https://www.canada.ca/en/public-health/services/diseases/2019-novel-coronavirus-infection/clinical-management-covid-19.html</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
  See: 7.1 Acute Respiratory Distress Syndrome (ARDS), Recommendations for mechanically ventilated adult and paediatric patients with ARDS, Recommendation #2
- Management of respiratory failure in the response to COVID-19. QEDSAP/SICCN/ SWAPNET Joint statement. Brisbane (AU): Queensland Health; 2020. Available from: <a href="https://www.health.qld.gov.au/\_data/assets/pdf\_file/0037/949582/covid-19-management-respiratory-failure.pdf">https://www.health.qld.gov.au/\_data/assets/pdf\_file/0037/949582/covid-19-management-respiratory-failure.pdf</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
   See: 5. Prone positioning



 Clinical management of severe acute respiratory infection (SARI) when COVID-19 disease is suspected: interim guidance. Geneva (CH): World Health Organization; 2020 Mar 13. Available from:

https://www.who.int/publications-detail/clinical-management-of-severe-acute-respiratory-infection-when-novel-coronavirus-(ncov)-infection-is-suspected. Accessed 2020 May 14

See: 7. Management of critical COVID-19: acute respiratory distress syndrome (ARDS), page 7

### Not COVID-19 Specific

Bamford P, Denmade C, Newmarch C, Shirley P, Singer B, Webb S, Whitmore D. Guidance for: prone positioning in adult critical care. London (UK): Intensive Care Society and Faculty of Intensive Care Medicine; 2019 Nov. Available from: <a href="https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5e6613a1dc75b87df82b78e1/t/5e72187c06c2956228316545/1584535679039/FICM-ICS-Prone-Position-Adult-Full.pdf">https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5e6613a1dc75b87df82b78e1/t/5e72187c06c2956228316545/1584535679039/FICM-ICS-Prone-Position-Adult-Full.pdf</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14

### **Review Articles**

- Dondorp AM, Hayat M, Aryal D, Beane A, Schultz MJ. Respiratory support in novel coronavirus disease (COVID-19) patients, with a focus on resource-limited settings. Am J Trop Med Hyg. 2020 Apr 21. [Epub ahead of print]
   PubMed: PM32319424
- Ghelichkhani P, Esmaeili M. Prone position in management of COVID-19 patients; a commentary. *Arch Acad Emerg Med.* 2020;8(1):e48.
   PubMed: PM32309812

### Additional References

 Meng L, Qiu H, Wan L, et al. Intubation and ventilation amid the COVID-19 outbreak: Wuhan's experience. *Anesthesiology*. 2020 Jun;132(6):1317-1332. Available from: <a href="https://anesthesiology.pubs.asahq.org/article.aspx?articleid=2763453">https://anesthesiology.pubs.asahq.org/article.aspx?articleid=2763453</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14

See: Ventilation Management PubMed: PM32195705

- COVID-19 education resources for proning during pandemic. Edmonton (AB):
   Critical Care Strategic Clinical Network, Alberta Health Services; 2020 Apr. Available from: <a href="https://site.cmg.io/scnresearch/Proning Education Package with links.pdf">https://site.cmg.io/scnresearch/Proning Education Package with links.pdf</a>.

   Accessed 2020 May 14
- 25. Coles RA. The use of prone positioning in COVID-19. London (UK): MedShr; 2020 Apr 7. Available from: <a href="https://en.medshr.net/open/prone-position">https://en.medshr.net/open/prone-position</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
- Gattinoni L, Chiumello D, Rossi S. COVID-19 pneumonia: ARDS or not? Critical care (London, England). 2020 Apr 16;24(1):154. Available from: <a href="https://ccforum.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/s13054-020-02880-z">https://ccforum.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/s13054-020-02880-z</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14

See: Clinical implications, Prone positioning



- COVID-19 (Novel Coronavirus). *Dynamed*. Ipswich (MA): EBSCO; 2020. Available from: <a href="https://www.dynamed.com/condition/covid-19-novel-coronavirus">https://www.dynamed.com/condition/covid-19-novel-coronavirus</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
  - See: Supportive Management, Management of Hypoxemia and Acute Respiratory Distress Syndrome (ARDS)
- Weingart S. COVID19 Awake pronation a guest write-up by David Gordon. EMCrit Blog. EMCrit Project; 2020 Apr 6. Available from: <a href="https://emcrit.org/emcrit/awake-pronation/">https://emcrit.org/emcrit/awake-pronation/</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
- Schultz MJ. High versus low PEEP in non-recruitable collapsed lung tissue: possible implications for patients with COVID-19. *Lancet Respir Med.* 2020 Apr 20. Available from: <a href="https://www.thelancet.com/action/showPdf?pii=S2213-2600%2820%2930180-6">https://www.thelancet.com/action/showPdf?pii=S2213-2600%2820%2930180-6</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
- Cheung JC, Ho LT, Cheng JV, Cham EYK, Lam KN. Staff safety during emergency airway management for COVID-19 in Hong Kong. *Lancet Respir Med.* 2020 Apr;8(4):e19. Available from: <a href="https://www.thelancet.com/pdfs/journals/lanres/PIIS2213-2600(20)30084-9.pdf">https://www.thelancet.com/pdfs/journals/lanres/PIIS2213-2600(20)30084-9.pdf</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14
- Slessarev M, Cheng J, Ondrejicka M, Arntfield R. Critical Care Western Research G. Patient self-proning with high-flow nasal cannula improves oxygenation in COVID-19 pneumonia. Can J Anaesth. 2020 Apr 21. [Epub ahead of print] <u>PubMed: PM32319029</u>
- Telias I, Katira BH, Brochard L. Is the prone position helpful during spontaneous breathing in patients with COVID-19? *JAMA*. 2020 May 15. [Epub ahead of print] Available from: https://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/fullarticle/2766290?guestAccessKey=195c55b4
  - -28d1-4ec0-b01e-
  - 7b06dde25164&utm\_source=silverchair&utm\_medium=email&utm\_campaign=article\_alert-jama&utm\_content=olf&utm\_term=051520/. Accessed 2020 May 15
- Farkas J. Proning the non-intubated patient. *PULMcrit Blog*. EMCrit Project; 2016 Sep 21. Available from: <a href="https://emcrit.org/pulmcrit/proning-nonintubated/">https://emcrit.org/pulmcrit/proning-nonintubated/</a>. Accessed 2020 May 14