

CADTH RAPID RESPONSE REPORT: SUMMARY OF ABSTRACTS

# Active versus Passive Warming Devices for Patients with Hypothermia in Pre-Hospital Settings: Clinical and Cost- Effectiveness

Service Line: Rapid Response Service  
Version: 1.0  
Publication Date: February 1, 2018  
Report Length: 6 Pages

**Authors:** Calvin Young, Charlene Argáez

**Cite As:** Active versus passive warming devices for patients with hypothermia in pre-hospital settings: clinical and cost-effectiveness. Ottawa: CADTH; 2018 Feb. (CADTH rapid response report: summary of abstracts).

**Acknowledgments:**

**Disclaimer:** The information in this document is intended to help Canadian health care decision-makers, health care professionals, health systems leaders, and policy-makers make well-informed decisions and thereby improve the quality of health care services. While patients and others may access this document, the document is made available for informational purposes only and no representations or warranties are made with respect to its fitness for any particular purpose. The information in this document should not be used as a substitute for professional medical advice or as a substitute for the application of clinical judgment in respect of the care of a particular patient or other professional judgment in any decision-making process. The Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health (CADTH) does not endorse any information, drugs, therapies, treatments, products, processes, or services.

While care has been taken to ensure that the information prepared by CADTH in this document is accurate, complete, and up-to-date as at the applicable date the material was first published by CADTH, CADTH does not make any guarantees to that effect. CADTH does not guarantee and is not responsible for the quality, currency, propriety, accuracy, or reasonableness of any statements, information, or conclusions contained in any third-party materials used in preparing this document. The views and opinions of third parties published in this document do not necessarily state or reflect those of CADTH.

CADTH is not responsible for any errors, omissions, injury, loss, or damage arising from or relating to the use (or misuse) of any information, statements, or conclusions contained in or implied by the contents of this document or any of the source materials.

This document may contain links to third-party websites. CADTH does not have control over the content of such sites. Use of third-party sites is governed by the third-party website owners' own terms and conditions set out for such sites. CADTH does not make any guarantee with respect to any information contained on such third-party sites and CADTH is not responsible for any injury, loss, or damage suffered as a result of using such third-party sites. CADTH has no responsibility for the collection, use, and disclosure of personal information by third-party sites.

Subject to the aforementioned limitations, the views expressed herein are those of CADTH and do not necessarily represent the views of Canada's federal, provincial, or territorial governments or any third party supplier of information.

This document is prepared and intended for use in the context of the Canadian health care system. The use of this document outside of Canada is done so at the user's own risk.

This disclaimer and any questions or matters of any nature arising from or relating to the content or use (or misuse) of this document will be governed by and interpreted in accordance with the laws of the Province of Ontario and the laws of Canada applicable therein, and all proceedings shall be subject to the exclusive jurisdiction of the courts of the Province of Ontario, Canada.

The copyright and other intellectual property rights in this document are owned by CADTH and its licensors. These rights are protected by the Canadian *Copyright Act* and other national and international laws and agreements. Users are permitted to make copies of this document for non-commercial purposes only, provided it is not modified when reproduced and appropriate credit is given to CADTH and its licensors.

**About CADTH:** CADTH is an independent, not-for-profit organization responsible for providing Canada's health care decision-makers with objective evidence to help make informed decisions about the optimal use of drugs, medical devices, diagnostics, and procedures in our health care system.

## Research Questions

1. What is the clinical effectiveness of active versus passive warming devices for patients with hypothermia in pre-hospital settings?
2. What is the cost-effectiveness of active versus passive warming devices for patients with hypothermia in pre-hospital settings?

## Key Findings

One randomized controlled trial was identified regarding the clinical effectiveness of active versus passive warming devices for patients with hypothermia in pre-hospital settings.

## Methods

A limited literature search was conducted on key resources including PubMed, The Cochrane Library, University of York Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (CRD) databases and a focused Internet search. No methodological filters were applied to limit the retrieval by study type. The search was limited to English language documents published between January 1, 2008 and January 25, 2018. Internet links were provided, where available.

## Selection Criteria

One reviewer screened citations and selected studies based on the inclusion criteria presented in Table 1.

**Table 1: Selection Criteria**

<b>Population</b>	Any patient in the pre-hospital setting experiencing mild hypothermia
<b>Intervention</b>	Active warming devices (e.g., Bair Hugger [forced warm air])
<b>Comparator</b>	Passive warming devices (e.g., warmed blankets)
<b>Outcomes</b>	Q1: Clinical effectiveness, change in body temperature, safety Q2: Cost-effectiveness
<b>Study Designs</b>	Health technology assessments, systematic reviews, meta-analyses, randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies, economic evaluations

## Results

Rapid Response reports are organized so that the higher quality evidence is presented first. Therefore, health technology assessment reports, systematic reviews, and meta-analyses are presented first. These are followed by randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies, and economic evaluations.

One randomized controlled trial was identified regarding the clinical of active versus passive warming devices for patients with hypothermia in pre-hospital settings. No relevant health technology assessments, systematic reviews, meta-analyses, non-randomized studies, or economic evaluations were identified.

Additional references of potential interest are provided in the appendix.

## Overall Summary of Findings

One randomized controlled trial<sup>1</sup> was identified regarding the clinical effectiveness of active versus passive warming devices for patients with hypothermia in pre-hospital settings. The authors of this study<sup>1</sup> evaluated the effect of providing both active warming and passive warming to mildly hypothermic trauma patients during ambulance transportation. Patients were randomized to receive either passive warming with blankets or active warming with a chemical heat pad in addition to passive warming with blankets.<sup>1</sup> Both treatment groups showed similar increases in mean core temperature; however, patients treated with additional active warming demonstrated significant decreases in cold discomfort, heart rate, and respiratory frequency.<sup>1</sup> The authors concluded that although adequate passive warming is an effective treatment for mildly hypothermic trauma patients, the addition of active warming may improve cold discomfort and reduce the cold induced stress response.<sup>1</sup>

## References Summarized

### Health Technology Assessments

No literature identified.

### Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses

No literature identified.

### Randomized Controlled Trials

1. Lundgren P, Henriksson O, Naredi P, Bjornstig U. The effect of active warming in prehospital trauma care during road and air ambulance transportation - a clinical randomized trial. *Scand J Trauma Resusc Emerg Med*. 2011 Oct 21;19:59. Available from: <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3214151>  
[PubMed: PM22017799](#)

### Non-Randomized Studies

No literature identified.

### Economic Evaluations

No literature identified.

## Appendix — Further Information

### Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses

#### *Alternative Population – Patients Undergoing Surgery*

2. Madrid E, Urrutia G, Figuls M, Pardo-Hernandez H, Campos JM, Paniagua P, et al. Active body surface warming systems for preventing complications caused by inadvertent perioperative hypothermia in adults. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*. 2016 Apr 21;4:CD009016.  
[PubMed: PM27098439](#)
3. Moola S, Lockwood C. Effectiveness of strategies for the management and/or prevention of hypothermia within the adult perioperative environment. *Int J Evid Based Healthc*. 2011 Dec;9(4):337-45.  
[PubMed: PM22093385](#)
4. Galvao CM, Marck PB, Sawada NO, Clark AM. A systematic review of the effectiveness of cutaneous warming systems to prevent hypothermia. *J Clin Nurs*. 2009 Mar;18(5):627-36.  
[PubMed: PM19239533](#)

### Non-Randomized Studies

#### *In Vitro Studies*

5. Zasa M, Flowers N, Zideman D, Hodgetts TJ, Harris T. A torso model comparison of temperature preservation devices for use in the prehospital environment. *Emerg Med J*. 2016 Jun;33(6):418-22.  
[PubMed: PM26838037](#)

#### *Qualitative Studies*

6. Alex J, Lundgren P, Henriksson O, Saveman BI. Being cold when injured in a cold environment--patients' experiences. *Int Emerg Nurs*. 2013 Jan;21(1):42-9.  
[PubMed: PM23273803](#)

### Guidelines and Recommendations

7. NICE. Major trauma: assessment and management: national clinical guideline [Internet]. London (UK): National Clinical Guideline Centre; 2016 Feb [cited 2018 Feb 01]. Available from: <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ng39/evidence/full-guideline-2308122833>  
*See section 13: Warming, pages 246– 251.*

### Clinical Practice Guidelines – Unspecified Methodology

8. Brown D, BC Accidental Hypothermia Working Group. Accidental hypothermia – evaluation, triage & management [Internet]. Vancouver (BC): BC Guidelines, Province of British Columbia; 2016 Dec [cited 2018 Feb 01]. Available from: [https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/bc-guidelines/bc\\_hypothermia\\_cpg.pdf](https://www2.gov.bc.ca/assets/gov/health/practitioner-pro/bc-guidelines/bc_hypothermia_cpg.pdf)

9. Perlman R, Callum J, Laflamme C, Tien H, Nascimento B, Beckett A, et al. A recommended early goal-directed management guideline for the prevention of hypothermia-related transfusion, morbidity, and mortality in severely injured trauma patients. *Crit Care*. 2016 Apr 20;20(1):107. Available from: <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4837515>  
[PubMed: PM27095272](#)
10. Zafren K, Giesbrecht G. State of Alaska cold injuries guidelines [Internet]. Juneau (AK): Department of Health and Social Services, Government of Alaska; 2014 Jul [cited 2018 Feb 01]. Available from: <http://dhss.alaska.gov/dph/Emergency/Documents/ems/documents/Alaska%20DHSS%20EMS%20Cold%20Injuries%20Guidelines%20June%202014.pdf>

## Review Articles

11. Haverkamp FJC, Giesbrecht GG, Tan ECTH. The prehospital management of hypothermia - an up-to-date overview. *Injury*. 2017 Nov 4.  
[PubMed: PM29162267](#)
12. Zafren K. Out-of-hospital evaluation and treatment of accidental hypothermia. *Emerg Med Clin North Am*. 2017 May;35(2):261-79.  
[PubMed: PM28411927](#)
13. Collins N, Daly S, Johnson P, Smith G. Pre-hospital use of intravenous in-line fluid warmers to reduce morbidity and mortality for major trauma patients: a review of the current literature. *Australasian J Paramed*; 2015 Jun [cited 2018 Feb 01];12(2). Available from: <https://ajp.paramedics.org/index.php/ajp/article/view/139>
14. Jensen KO, Jensen JM, Sprengel K. Practicability of avoiding hypothermia in resuscitation room phase in severely injured patients. *J Med Eng Technol*. 2015 May;39(4):223-5.  
[PubMed: PM25879707](#)
15. Moffatt SE. Hypothermia in trauma. *Emerg Med J*. 2013 Dec;30(12):989-96.  
[PubMed: PM23243045](#)
16. Beekley AC. Damage control resuscitation: a sensible approach to the exsanguinating surgical patient. *Crit Care Med*. 2008 Jul;36(7 Suppl):S267-S274.  
[PubMed: PM18594252](#)